

ENTREPRENEURSHIP TEACHING FOR SELF-EMPLOYMENT AMONG HIGHER LEARNING STUDENTS IN TANZANIA: A LESSON LEARNT FROM SUCCESSFUL GRADUATE ENTREPRENEURS

Agustino Silverius Mbunda, Assistant Lecturer, Department of Business Administration, College of Business Education (CBE), P. O. Box 1968, Dar es Salaam, Tanzania; E-mail: a.silverius@cbe.ac.tz
Alsen Florian Kapinga, Lecturer, Department of Business Administration, College of Business Education (CBE), P. O. Box 1968, Dar es Salaam, Tanzania a.kapinga@cbe.ac.tz

ABSTRACT

Despite several years of investing entrepreneurship education in Tanzanian higher learning education, still a large portion of graduates are incompetent, hence, they cannot start-up their own business ventures. The current study employed the Social Learning Theory to explore effective teaching and assessment methods appropriate to entrepreneurship education in order to create self-employed graduates of higher learning education by drawing experience from some successful graduate entrepreneurs in Tanzania. The study aimed at filling the gap in the literature by exploring effective teaching methods and assessment procedures for entrepreneurship education to enhance self-employment among graduates of higher learning education in Tanzania. This is a qualitative study that applied a mixed-method approach utilizing interviews, observation, and document review in data collection. The study was done in Dar es Salaam City using both purposive and snowball chain sampling techniques whereby, 65 respondents participated in the study. The collected data were analysed using content analysis technique in which themes were generated and discussed in accordance with the research questions. The findings of the study indicated that, in Tanzania, traditional teaching methods are mostly used to teach entrepreneurship education in higher learning education. Lecturing teaching method and paper and pencil form of assessment are commonly preferred by instructors while teaching entrepreneurship education. Graduates of higher learning education do encounter several challenges, and those challenges are connected to individual weaknesses of a graduate, poor preparation of students in higher learning education, failure of legal compliance, and lack of financial capital. Based on the observed challenges, the study recommends the following: Firstly, students should effectively be engaged in practical activities related to entrepreneurship while still at the colleges and universities. Secondly, all instructors teaching entrepreneurship education should be equipped with sufficient knowledge through in-service trainings in order to update them with relevant skills needed in the markets. Thirdly, instructors should create a balance between theoretical and practical learning while teaching entrepreneurship education, and for the research purpose, colleges, and universities should have their own database concerning with graduates who have succeeded to employ themselves after graduation

Key words: *Entrepreneurship Education, Higher Learning Education, Teaching and Assessment Methods, Self-Employed Graduates*

INTRODUCTION

Background Information

Due to an increased rate of unemployment phenomenon among the world community members, entrepreneurship education (EE) is considered as a tool for promoting self-employment to graduates of tertiary education including those graduating from higher learning education (HLE) (Gyamfi, 2014; Kalimasi, 2014; Mangasini, 2015; Peter, & Rankhumise, 2012). In addition, the World Entrepreneurship Investment Forum (WIEF) held in 2017 in Manama, Bahrain, agreed that the knowledge on entrepreneurship should promote domestic investment, thus leading to job creation in the context of the current challenges and opportunities associated with the fourth industrial revolution era (WIEF, 2019). However, things are different as some of the studies indicate that the majority of graduates, Tanzania in particular, experience failure to start-up their own business ventures despite having graduated from different institutions teaching EE (Ghisina, 2014; Lekeko, Peter & Rankhumise, 2012). In the current study, a graduate is referred to as any individual person graduated from the higher learning institution offering business studies including EE.

Recently, the body of literature indicates that there is a significant relationship between EE and the success of entrepreneurs (Bawuah, Buame, & Hinson, 2006; Lonappan & Devaraj, 2011; Zhou & Xu, 2012; Fatoki, 2014). This being the case, EE is considered as the study of sources of business opportunities, deals with how to discover, exploit and evaluate them for business start-up (Fatoki, 2014). Furthermore, EE is an essential strategy for creating future goods or services (Qian & Lai, 2012; Muñoz, Salinero, Peña, & Sanchez de Pablo, 2019). As a result, all over the world, EE is taught in colleges and universities either as a full programme or a part of business-related programmes (Arasti, Kiani, & Imanipour, 2013; Ghisina, 2014; Kalimasi, 2014).

In the United States of America, for instance, EE started to be taught in higher learning education (HLE) earlier than other countries in the 1940s, and up to the 2000s, there were more than 1600 learning institutions with EE related courses (Zhou & Xu, 2012). Other countries from different continents in Europe, Australia, Asia, and Africa followed later. For example, in Canada, serious teaching of EE started in the 1970s while in Germany, China, and India it started in the 1990s (Zhou & Xu, 2012). In India, EE started with nine pilot colleges as the government's strategy to expand employment, and up to 2013, there were about 100 departments dealing with EE (Pradhan & Sahoo, 2013). In Africa, most of HLE introduced EE in the 2000s (Bawuah, Buame, & Hinson, 2006). For example, the University of Ghana introduced EE as a compulsory course for all freshers entering into university in the academic year 2015 (Bawuah et al., 2006).

In Tanzania, the decision to integrate EE in HLE is linked to the National Higher Education and Training Policy (URT, 1999), and the Small and Medium Enterprise Development Policy (URT, 2003). Both policies, consider mainstreaming entrepreneurship in the education sector as a deliberate effort to expand employment opportunities, thus, reducing the rate of unemployment to graduates after their school lives. The intervention of mainstreaming entrepreneurship education in higher learning education system aimed at promoting the spirit of graduates of HLE to become entrepreneurs, making education system to be a job creator, and coping with those changes associated with science and technology (Olomi & Sabokwigina, 2010). As a result, recently, most higher learning institutions in Tanzania have been offering various courses related EE so as to respond to the national strategy of eradicating unemployment phenomenon (Kalimasi, 2014; Olomi & Sabokwigina, 2010). However, ineffective models and methods used in preparing students to become entrepreneurs are the key identified obstacles to the quality of EE provided in Tanzania. The use of traditional methods of teaching such as normal lectures and written based form of assessments, are sources of graduates' failure to start-up their own business since such forms of methods do not focus on promoting creativity and innovation that are essential components for someone to become an entrepreneur (Fulgence, 2015; Kalimasi & Herman, 2016; Olomi & Sabokwigina, 2010). Furthermore, it has been argued that those traditional approaches of teaching EE, instead of preparing students to become entrepreneurs, are preparing them to be employees of other entrepreneurs (Fayomi, et al., 2019). Consequently, based on the weaknesses of those teaching methods, unemployment as a critical phenomenon in Tanzania has been increasing rapidly instead of decreasing with the increase in number of graduates (Kalimasi, 2014).

It is argued that the need for effective teaching of EE is of paramount importance to enhance self-employment among the graduates of HLE whose number tends to increase very fast in Tanzania (Fulgence, 2015). However, despite several years of investing EE in Tanzanian HLE, still a large portion of graduates are incompetent, hence, they cannot start-up their own business ventures (Fulgence, 2015; Kalimasi 2014). So far, several studies have been done in an attempt to address the challenges associated with the teaching of EE in Tanzanian higher education. Some of the notable studies are those done by Olomi & Sabokwigina (2010) who investigated the state of development of entrepreneurship education in Tanzania business schools, Fulgence (2015) who assessed the status of entrepreneurship education in HLE with a special focus on education colleges in Tanzania, Mangasini (2015) who investigated barriers to business start-up and assessing determinants on graduate's entrepreneurial entry intentions, and Kalimasi & Herman (2016) who explored the integration of entrepreneurship education across public universities in Tanzania. Generally, none of the above studies has tried to relate directly the contributions of successful graduate entrepreneurs to the improvements of methods of teaching EE in Tanzania. Therefore, it is against this background, the study is aimed at filling the gap in the literature by exploring effective EE teaching methods and assessment procedures for self-employment among the graduates of higher learning education based on experience from successful graduate entrepreneurs in Tanzania.

Research purpose and questions

The primary concern of this study was to explore effective teaching and assessment methods appropriate to EE in order to create self-employed graduates of higher learning education (HLE) by drawing experience from some successful graduate entrepreneurs in Tanzania. The study thus embarked to answer the following research questions:

- What are the teaching and assessment methods of EE mostly used by HLE in creating self-employed individuals in Tanzania?
- What are the challenges facing graduate entrepreneurs in a business start-up in Tanzania?
- What are the strategies for improving teaching and assessment methods of EE used in HLE in creating self-employed individuals in Tanzania?

Study rationale

The current study contributes to an already emerging literature in Tanzania on strategies for improving teaching and assessment methods of EE in HLE. The study draws experience from successful graduate entrepreneurs in Tanzania whose inputs are very important to curriculum developers and policymakers while planning for effective delivery of EE for the creation of self-employed individuals in Tanzania.

REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE

Theoretical underpinning of the study

The current study was guided by Social Learning Theory (SLT). It is also referred to as Social Cognitive Theory (SCT). The theory was pioneered by Herbert Bandura whose work began in the 1960s. The theory has been used in various studies related to students' learning including the area of entrepreneurship. The study by Byrne & Toutain (2012) found that 60.8% of 97 reviewed articles were connected to SCT as compared to other famous learning theories such as behaviorism, humanism and constructivism. The main assumption of the SLT is that people learn through observation, imitation, and modeling when there are interactions with other people in the social context. By observing others, people acquire skills, rules, strategies, attitudes, and beliefs. Also, people learn how to appropriately use learned modeled behaviour. Bandura (1994) came up with the concept of self-efficacy which is referred to an individual's personal belief of his or her capacity to accomplish the task. According to Bandura (1994), self-efficacy results from the mastery of experiences, social persuasion, social modeling and psychological responses. Bandura (1994) argues that the higher the self-efficacy the higher the possibility of accomplishing the task while the lower the self-efficacy the lower the possibility of accomplishing the task.

Regarding the current study as far as EE is concerned, instructors and other people in the social context should be role models and mentors to students (Marquardt & Waddill, 2004). In order to learn EE effectively and become successful entrepreneurs, students are required to observe and imitate the activities of successful entrepreneurs. The involvement of successful graduate entrepreneurs is of great importance to re-shape existing teaching methods and assessment of EE in HLE. Besides suggesting how teaching methods and assessment procedures should be improved, successful graduate entrepreneurs are role models to other graduates who have failed to start-up their own business ventures due to various reasons because they are in the field of entrepreneurship. The theory of SCT is relevant to the current study because it will help in exploring about what successful graduate entrepreneurs define EE and how it can be taught for self-employment among the graduate of HLE in Tanzania. In addition, successful graduate entrepreneurs as role models in society can address various challenges encountering graduates to start-up their own business ventures. Furthermore, it is within the basis of the selected theory in which the findings of the study will be discussed in comparison to the underlying theoretical stances.

Meaning of an entrepreneur and entrepreneurship

An entrepreneur is an individual who renovates a business which was not existing before (Qian & Lai, 2012). It is also considered as an individual who discovers, evaluates, and exploits opportunities to create future goods or services (Muñoz, Salinero, Peña, & Sanchez de Pablo, 2019). On the other side, entrepreneurship as an activity is done by an entrepreneur which involves four main components namely as vision, innovation, risk taking, and organizing the business (Mohammed, 2018). It is an ability to foresee and start a new business venture by using the learned knowledge and experiences from the environment to manage the business despite the available challenges which might face the business (Fatoki, 2014). In the current study, we have defined an entrepreneur as any person who has started up his or her own business venture (s) after graduating with EE from the college or university.

Teaching of EE

Currently, there have been various suggestions among scholars about how EE can be taught for effective learning. While some scholars try to direct about which kinds of teaching methods suit EE (Arasti, Kiani, & Imanipour, 2013; Lonappan & Devaraj, 2011), others suggest conditions guiding the decision to select a particular method for EE (Pradhan & Sahoo, 2013). For example, according to Lonappan & Devaraj (2011), methods such as project, lecture, report writing, discussion, individual presentation, guest speaker, video recording, web-based and seminar, are more appropriate to EE. In addition to that, Arasti, Kiani, & Imanipour (2013) view that while students are taught about business planning, the use of case studies and lectures are more appropriate. Henry et al. (2006) suggest that there should be a variety of methods to teach EE varying from lecture presentations, handouts, group discussions, case studies and role plays. According to the European Union, the use of learning by doing, digital tools, internship, interacting with entrepreneurs, multimedia, mentoring, and experiment are highly recommended for EE teaching (Fayomi, et al., 2019).

However, the second group of scholars do not mention methods to be used while teaching EE, instead, they suggest guiding situations for the selection of EE teaching methods. For example, Pradhan & Sahoo (2013) argue that there is no specific method to teach EE but the selection of approaches should consider the relationship among four important components of EE. The components are programme goals, audience, content and assessment. Likewise, Arasti, Kiani, & Imanipour (2013) suggest that the course objective of EE should guide on how to teach students. In the same line with suggesting guiding conditions for method selection, Fayomi, et al. (2019) argue that key determinants to EE teaching are who teaches, content to be taught and the place where learning is taking place.

Therefore, based on the above-reviewed literature on how to teach EE, one would identify two categories of teaching methods and assessment procedures which are either in traditional or action-based methods. According to Arasti, Kiani & Imanipour (2013), the use of traditional methods such as normal lectures, make a student passive, and thus cannot prepare him or her to work as an independent entrepreneur, instead, these methods prepare a student to work with entrepreneurs (employees of other entrepreneurs). On the other side, it is highly recommended that action-based methods should be used to teach EE. According to Pradhan & Sahoo (2013), action-based methods refer to those teaching approaches characterized by learning by doing, involvement in the real-life situation or more didactical and conventional procedures whose efficiency can be assessed. Examples of action-based methods are role-plays, case studies, project work, simulation, games, and so forth.

EMPIRICAL STUDIES ON CHALLENGES ASSOCIATED TO EE TEACHING METHODS

Experience from the global context

In China, for instance, Zhou & Xu (2012) conducted a study to review entrepreneurship education in three universities in China including Beijing, Renin, and Tsinghua in comparison to the USA universities. It was observed that despite some improvements made in China about EE in HLE, still, China is lagging behind compared to the USA. Among other recommendations, the study insisted on the provision of intensive training to teachers in order to improve EE because most of the teaching methods are traditional oriented.

In India, Pradhan & Sahoo (2013) assessed the challenges of EE in India. Firstly, it was observed that EE is not holistically taught in India since it focuses much on education-related to business management or general business. Being the case, some important skills such as leadership, creative thinking, exposure to technology and innovation are little emphasized. Secondly, it was observed that most of the teaching approaches and assessment are traditional oriented. Therefore, the study recommended that there should be improvements in teaching methods and assessment procedures to make EE more effective.

In South Africa, Radipere (2012) examined the state of EE and how it was taught in South African universities. The study found that the intended objective of EE is not met since many of the entrepreneurial graduates seek jobs due to the weaknesses of teaching methods characterized by traditional approaches of teaching (teacher-centered) rather than learner-centered. The study recommended that EE should adapt interactive methods of teaching such as simulation that allows students to practice what they learn theoretically. However, despite the good recommendation made by Radipere (2012) on improving methods of teaching EE, yet the study did not include contributions of successful graduate entrepreneurs in improving methods for EE teaching.

Another study was done in Ghana by Gyamfi (2014) to evaluate the concept of entrepreneurship education as a tool for economic growth through job creation. It was a quantitative study that included 100 graduates of the University of Professional Studies in Accra who graduated between 2005 and 2010. The findings indicated that most of them established their business ventures. However, the study recommended the review of the model for EE to make it more effective as a tool for economic development. Although the study by Gyamfi included graduates, the intention was not to explore their ideas on how teaching methods can be improved for effective EE.

Experience from the local context (Tanzania)

Kalimasi (2014) conducted a feasibility study on the desirability of entrepreneurship education from lecturers in two public universities in Tanzania including The University of Dar Es Salaam and Mzumbe University. With the guide of in-depth interviews, it was found that EE is not well-integrated in HLE since it is not taught with respect to the recommended pedagogy. It was recommended that for effective teaching of EE, it should focus on necessary skills for employment and, donor projects on entrepreneurship should be customized focusing on the Tanzanian context.

Fulgence (2015) had a descriptive study which employed a design science approach to assess the status of entrepreneurship education in Tanzanian higher learning institutions. Data was collected from the management of those institutions, entrepreneurship educators and students. The study observed that besides other challenges to EE provision in Tanzania, teaching, and assessment of EE are based on traditional methods and there were few facilities such as books. As for other previously cited studies, it was recommended that there should be the integration of experiential and innovative methods of teaching and assessment to make EE more effective.

Another study was done by Mangasini (2015) for the aim of identifying barriers to business start-up and assessing determinants on graduate's entrepreneurial entry intentions. The study employed a cross-section design with questionnaires whereby, 308 graduate respondents were studied. The findings indicated that besides other challenges to business set-up, inappropriate teaching methods, lack of business experience, deficiency in a university programme, commitments, and bureaucratic issues such as legal procedures in business start-up are major challenges to EE in Tanzania.

Therefore, based on the above-reviewed studies from both outside and inside Tanzania about the implementation of EE, definitely, one would come to realize that there have been several challenges associated with the methods of providing quality EE in colleges and universities. However, there is some missing information about what successful graduate entrepreneurs suggest about improving those methods of teaching EE in Tanzania. Therefore, this study aimed at filling the gap in the literature by exploring effective EE teaching methods and assessment procedures for self-employment among graduates of higher learning education based on experience from successful graduate entrepreneurs in Tanzania.

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

Research approach, study population and sampling strategy

This is a qualitative study that applied a mixed-method approach in data collection. The study was done in Dar es Salaam city focusing on successful graduate entrepreneurs who are of great importance in providing their experience for improving effective teaching of EE for self-employment among graduates of HLE in Tanzania. The selection of Dar es Salaam city is based on the reason that it is one of the biggest commercial cities in Tanzania with many graduate entrepreneurs who are self-employed through various businesses ranging from small, medium and large-scale enterprises. The population of the study was graduate entrepreneurs who have succeeded in entrepreneurial activity after graduating from different Universities/Colleges. The study used purposive and snowball sampling techniques to select 65 respondents. In the study, successful graduate entrepreneurs graduated from different colleges and universities in Tanzania between 2005 and 2019 were identified and studied. The selection of informants focused on criteria based on the ability of graduates engaging in entrepreneurial activities so as to obtain rich information concerning effective teaching of EE in Tanzanian HLE.

DATA COLLECTION METHODS

In order to ensure validity and reliability of the research data, the researchers used different tools for data collection because with different research instruments, it is possible to meet reliability of the research data (Denscombe, 2010). The primary data were collected through in-depth interview and observation. The researcher conducted face-to face interviews with graduate entrepreneurs in order to obtain in depth information on their success. Secondary data were

obtained by reviewing related literature such as journal articles and books for definitions, background information gap establishment, methods and limitation.

Analysis

Content analysis technique was used in data analysis following three steps as suggested by (Hebbberman & Miles, 1994) which include data organization, reduction, and interpretation whereby themes were created and discussed. Again, some quotes from informants were presented so as to provide readers with insights about the feelings of informants based on the studied topic.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

Demographic Characteristics of Respondents

Table 1. Demographic characteristics of respondents.

| PERSONAL DETAILS | | Number of respondents | | | Percentage of respondents (%) | | |
|---|----------------------------|-----------------------|--------|-----------|-------------------------------|-------|-------------|
| Sex | | Male | Female | Total | Men | Women | Total |
| Number of Respondents | | 22 | 43 | 65 | 33.8 | 66.2 | 100 |
| Age groups | 18 – 35 years | 11 | 38 | 49 | 16.9 | 58.5 | 75.4 |
| | 36 – 50 years | 10 | 5 | 15 | 15.4 | 7.7 | 23.1 |
| | Above 50 years | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1.5 | 0 | 1.5 |
| level of education | Certificate | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| | Diploma | 3 | 18 | 21 | 4.6 | 27.7 | 32.3 |
| | Bachelor | 19 | 23 | 42 | 29.2 | 35.4 | 64.6 |
| | Post graduate studies | 0 | 2 | 2 | 0 | 3.1 | 3.1 |
| Number of years after graduation | Below 1 | 2 | 7 | 9 | 3.1 | 10.8 | 13.9 |
| | Between 1-3 | 7 | 11 | 18 | 10.8 | 16.9 | 27.7 |
| | Between 4-6 | 9 | 19 | 28 | 13.8 | 30.8 | 44.6 |
| | 6+ | 4 | 6 | 10 | 6.2 | 9.2 | 15.4 |
| Category of entrepreneurial activities | Agricultural activities | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1.5 | 0 | 1.5 |
| | Nonagricultural activities | 16 | 31 | 47 | 24.6 | 47.7 | 72.3 |
| | Mixed activities | 1 | 12 | 13 | 1.5 | 18.5 | 20 |
| Experience in entrepreneurship | Below 1 year | 3 | 4 | 7 | 4.6 | 6.2 | 10.8 |
| | 1-5 years | 18 | 39 | 57 | 27.7 | 60 | 87.7 |
| | 5+ years | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1.5 | 0 | 1.5 |
| Source of business idea and capital | Individual interests | 4 | 19 | 23 | 6.2 | 29.2 | 35.4 |
| | Family and friends | 4 | 8 | 12 | 6.2 | 12.3 | 18.5 |
| | Others | 14 | 26 | 40 | 21.5 | 40 | 61.5 |
| Current size of the business | Small | 17 | 27 | 44 | 26.2 | 41.5 | 67.7 |
| | Medium | 4 | 10 | 14 | 6.2 | 15.4 | 21.6 |
| | Large | 1 | 6 | 7 | 1.5 | 9.2 | 10.7 |
| Employment information | Public sector | 3 | 8 | 11 | 4.6 | 12.3 | 16.9 |
| | NGOs | 2 | 5 | 7 | 3.1 | 7.7 | 10.8 |
| | Self-employment | 17 | 30 | 47 | 26.2 | 46.2 | 72.4 |

Source: Field data on 20th – 27th October 2020

Table 1 indicates the demographic characteristics of the respondents which is very important in this study because they provide a general picture of how the challenge of unemployment affects graduates. In the study, 65 respondents were included out of which, 22 (33.8%) were men and 43 (66.2%) were women. Based on age groups, most of them 75% were aged between 18 and 35 years, then (23%) were between 36 and 50 years, and very few of them (1.5%) aged above 50 years. This implies that most productive people who have been suffering from unemployment after graduation is aged between 18 and 35 years old. It was further observed that people with bachelor (64%) degrees engage in entrepreneurship rather than other levels of graduates, and most of them (44.6%) have either graduated between 4 and 6 years ago. In addition, a large position of successful graduate entrepreneurs (87.7%) has between 1 and 5 years in the field of entrepreneurship. That is to say success in the business does not come within a short period of time as most people think, but it is a struggle that needs tolerance and depends on several years for someone to succeed. With reference to the field data, it is obvious that most of the graduates in the urban areas do not invest in agricultural-related activities despite the fact that agriculture is the backbone of the national economy in Tanzania. This being the case, most graduates (72.3%) in the urban areas like Dar es Salaam prefer to deal with the business characterized by non-agricultural activities such as online business, salon, bakery, grocery, and so forth. It was also found that most graduate entrepreneurs (67.7%) have a small business, and very few of them (10.7%) have a large business. More interestingly, besides the family and individual influences, there are other sources of business ideas and capital for graduates to start a business.

Common teaching and assessment methods used for EE in HLE

In an attempt to investigate one of the research questions aimed at examining common teaching and assessment methods used for EE in HLE, interviews were conducted in data collection whereby the following sub-themes were developed.

Traditional vs practical teaching methods

The study found that traditional teaching and assessment methods were commonly used in HLE. The use of lecture, group discussion and question and answers were mostly preferred by instructors while teaching entrepreneurship. The study further observed that instructors relied much on paper and pencil form of assessment whereby students are required to sit for written tests, quizzes, and exams to accomplish their studies. Among all interviewed informants 65 (100%), nobody revealed that she or he was trained by practical-oriented approaches such as engaging in entrepreneurial projects, attending purely entrepreneurial study tours, learning live from experienced entrepreneurs and preparing and practicing a business plan. During the interview sessions, respondent 1 and 2 respectively had the following to say:

... there was no difference in learning between entrepreneurship and other modules. Instructors always used lectures and written assignments to evaluate learning.

Sometimes what and how we were taught is not what really transpires in the business world because the learning process was too theoretical, and lecturers may even turn to be motivational speakers.

Although some respondents reported about the use of practical methods in learning, yet the methods were not given priority by instructors. One of the respondents said:

We were told to prepare a business plan and submit to our lecturer for implementation. I did it but no further actions were taken to implement my business plan.

Based on the findings above, this implies that most graduates from colleges and universities are good at theories related to entrepreneurship rather than practical knowledge due to nature of common methods used in preparing them.

Usefulness of traditional teaching and assessment methods

Despite some identified weaknesses of traditional methods, several benefits have been reported by respondents. It was evident that traditional methods provide basic entrepreneurial knowledge and skills which are important for someone to start and run a business. This was evident as one of the respondents stated:-

Due to the knowledge, I have received about entrepreneurship, currently, I have been a trainer of our eight branch managers because most of them need basic entrepreneurial knowledge and skills.

Some important knowledge and skills such as customer care, creativity, opportunity identification, risk calculation, network identification, and quality of an entrepreneur are all taught through traditional methods especially through a

lecture method and book reading. Reporting to the importance of traditional methods, some of the respondents had the following to say:-

Customer care and creativity are challenging aspects to win customers nowadays. However, to me, they are no longer challenges, since I have sufficient knowledge about them.

With entrepreneurial skills, I was able to start another business even after I lost everything in my first business, it was difficult, but I managed.

It was further evident that classroom knowledge helps entrepreneurs to relate theory and practice. Thus, it serves as a technique to solve different challenges in the business as one of the respondents reported:-

Everything I see in my business today was theoretically presented in the class. I can now effectively relate classroom knowledge with what is happening in my business today.

Limitations of traditional teaching and assessment methods in EE

Through several interviews with respondents, it was obviously evident that traditional methods were theoretical oriented. Those methods were reported not to engage students effectively to practice entrepreneurship although students themselves prefer learning by doing. For example, during the interview session, one of the respondents asserted:-

I had no time to practice entrepreneurship in the college although it was possible to do it. Lecture methods and tests dominated our entire programme of study.

The failure of engaging students with entrepreneurial activities in colleges and universities, the situation leads to shallow learning rather than deep learning. As a result, most students focus on exams rather than understanding what they learn and practice it in the real world of entrepreneurship. In an attempt to clarify the concept of shallow learning, one of the respondents said:-

Honestly, during my studies, my key focus was to make my GPA bigger. I used to memorize everything taught in the class in order to pass my exams.

Some instructors do not contextualise students with relevant examples while teaching entrepreneurship. As a result, students experience a failure to relate classroom knowledge with entrepreneurship in real life as one of the respondents said:-

I remember when I was studying for my certificate, I was taught by one lecturer who taught us as if we were not Tanzanians. She used to give us examples from Europe because she studied there. To me, that was not good for effective understanding of entrepreneurship in our local context.

Traditional methods of EE teaching seem to be a key source of graduate failure to start their own business ventures because those methods do not prepare students for self-employment, instead, students are prepared for wage jobs. Stating about the weaknesses of traditional methods, one of the respondents said:

On my side, a major challenge comes from the education system which prepares graduates to become employed and the majority of graduates are so selective when it comes to employment, they prefer white-color jobs.

Challenges faced by graduate entrepreneurs in establishing business

In the current study, one of the research objectives aimed at exploring challenges faced by graduate entrepreneurs in starting a new business in Tanzania. Based on the responses from the informants, several issues emerged during the discussion as presented below.

Personal related challenges

It was found that some graduates have low tolerance while starting a new business. Always, they are seeking for quick successes. With the presence of various challenges that might affect the business at its initial stage, some graduates become very easy to surrender instead of struggling for the progress of the business. In addition, the majority of graduates fail to take risks due to the fear of loss to the new businesses they wish to start. Giving more explanations about the issue of tolerance, one of the respondents said:-

Before the business, I have now, I tried several times. Sometimes my business went wrong but I didn't surrender. It took me about five years to gain more experience in my business until now.

Some graduates have a mentality of thinking that wage employment is better than self-employment. In some cases, parents or guardians influence their children about what job to do after graduation. As a result, despite the availability

of business opportunities, most of the graduates prefer more wage employment than self-employment. The truth about the notion stated above was clearly evident as one of the respondents asserted:

It was not easy for me to become an entrepreneur because both my parents (mother and father) wanted me to seek white-color jobs that would reflect my family status.

Moreover, for some graduates, challenges in starting a business were connected to an individual inability in identifying business opportunities. Although in their studies students are taught about different sources of business ideas, yet, not all graduates can manage to identify those opportunities as reported by one of the respondents who said:-

To me, there was a big problem in the identification and screening a business idea. It took me several years to conclude what kind of business to start.

Poor commitment is another challenge reported by respondents while sharing their views. Some graduates are not committed to the business they wish to start and run. Every business needs the owner to commit him or her-self for successful making of profit. Therefore, laziness is an enemy of business success.

Teaching related challenges

Effective training for students is one of the key factors that stimulate graduates' competence in starting a new business. The nature of entrepreneurial teaching in colleges and universities is claimed to be more theoretical to students which in turn do not equip graduates with sufficient skills to become entrepreneurs. Most teaching and learning approaches end up transforming abstracts knowledge with little simulation. Therefore, students do not practice entrepreneurship during their studies. This was vividly evident as one of the respondents maintained:

Cramming notes in the lecture cannot make someone to be an entrepreneur unless he/she learns to practice entrepreneurship.

Legal and financial related challenges

It was further observed that legal systems have a great contribution to the failure of business startup. Several issues related to bureaucracy in business registration and licensing for business beginners discourage most graduates who wish to start new businesses. Prolonged bureaucratic procedures are done by the government through its respective organ BRELA, which still does not give enough favor to business beginners especially graduates. In some cases, some graduates have inadequate knowledge to comply with legal requirements for business set up. Speaking about challenges associated to legal matters, one of the respondents reported:-

It took me more than three months to accomplish business registration procedures in BRELA. Of course, I faced a lot of disturbances and I still hate those procedures.

Most of the graduates also lack the financial capital to start and run new businesses. Most of the institutions or individuals offering financial services such as banks, have high interest percentage of rates which do not favor business beginners like graduates. Speaking about the challenge of financial capital, one of the respondents blamed:-

Most graduates have business ideas and would like to start their own business ventures but there is a challenge on where to get a better financial capital with affordable interest rates.

Inadequate markets and marketing strategies

Proper marketing of entrepreneurial products is another important component in business. It was observed that some new products produced by small entrepreneurs are faced with a shortage of markets because they are new in the markets and need some costs for advertisements. Always customers have the tendency of fearing to adopt new products. As a result, lack of stable markets leads to low sales, thus, leading to collapse of businesses owned by entrepreneurs.

Strategies of improving EE teaching in HLE

It was the role of third research objective in this study to identify strategies of improving teaching and assessment methods used by HLE in teaching EE for creating self-employed individuals in Tanzania. Through interviews with respondents, the following issues emanated.

Adaptation of practical and experiential teaching methods

Most of interviewed graduates declared their interests in the need for practical methods of teaching entrepreneurship rather than theoretical learning. It was suggested that students should be engaged in a variety of activities that would assist them to practice entrepreneurship while still at the college or university. A method entrepreneurial projects and simulation were highly recommended by respondents as two of the graduates said:-

Students should practice entrepreneurship during their studies. For example, students in groups should contribute 20,000/= and assigned to start a business that will help them to learn entrepreneurship practically.

Students should practice online business during their studies, this will help them to experience what they learn in the class to the real situation of business running.

In addition to practical methods needed by students, experiential teaching and learning methods were considered to be of paramount importance for inspiration of all students to become entrepreneurs. Students need to learn from successful entrepreneurs in their local context. The use of the guest speaker, field trips, case studies, and other experiential related methods help students to learn from others who have succeeded in entrepreneurship, thus, creates more courage for new business startup among graduates.

Integrating theory and practice into learning

Some graduates declared their interest in having both theory and practice in learning. The most important thing is creating a balance between theory and practice in learning. Theoretical approaches provide a foundation of several concepts in entrepreneurship learning. However, practical approaches such as simulation, entrepreneurial study tours, project work, and other related approaches are of paramount importance to relate the classroom knowledge with what is happening in the world of work. Concerning the importance of theory in learning two respondents asserted:-

Theory is not bad in learning, but instructors should always associate it with practical activities. If a teacher teaches about teaching a business plan for instance, a student should also be taught about how to write it.

Therefore, based on the above-presented findings, it is more obvious to argue that lecture and written assessment are the most common methods used in HLE to train students the knowledge on entrepreneurship. In every semester, students are required to sit for tests and examinations to accomplish their studies. There are very limited practical entrepreneurial skills in colleges and universities. Action-based teaching methods and learning through experiences such as preparation of the business plan, study tour, project work and others, are not given more emphasis in HLE. Most of the course instructors depend much on paper and pencil form for the assessment of students in both continuous assessment (CA) and end of semester examination (SE). Indeed, relying on a knowledge-based form of teaching and assessment is contrary to the curricula that insist on competence-based training. These findings are in line with other similar studies done to investigate common methods used in EE teaching by (Kalimasi, 2014 and Radipere, 2012) whereby, all studies indicate that traditional teaching approaches are mostly used by instructors than action or experiential approaches in EE teaching. In reality, the use of traditional methods of teaching characterized by teacher-centered rather than learner-centered makes the learning and teaching process one-way traffic. As a result, students become inactive rather than active learners (Radipere, 2012). Therefore, for effective learning of EE, students are required to be integrated with both theoretical and practical learning.

Moreover, despite some of the weaknesses associated with traditional methods of EE teaching in HLE, still, those approaches play important roles to students' learning. For example, the use of the lecture method and written form of assessment was reported to be of great importance in understanding the general knowledge of EE. The current findings on the importance of lecture method and written form of assessment concur with the study done by Fatoki (2014) which indicates that traditional methods such lecture is still important in EE teaching. The lecture method and other traditional methods provide a theoretical basis for the general knowledge of EE such as customer care, creativity, risk calculation, network, quality of an entrepreneur, and keeping business records. This implies that traditional methods are still demanded in HLE for EE teaching but there should be a balance between traditional methods and other methods for effective learning of EE. However, some studies such as Arasti, et al., (2013); Lekeko et al., (2012) and Radipere (2012) give an emphasis on traditional approaches but insist on action approaches for effective learning of EE.

Most of the traditional methods of teaching such as lectures and various forms of written assessment are theoretical oriented, thus, promote shallow learning instead of deep learning which in turn leads to students' failure of relating classroom knowledge with real life. In addition to that, students focus on passing their exams and getting big GPAs rather than understanding what they learn and be able to practice. As a result, some practical methods for effective delivery of EE such as project work, case study, development of the new venture, problem-solving is not given priority in EE teaching in HLE.

As it was revealed from some informants, the majority of graduates are faced with different challenges in starting their own business ventures such as failure in screening business ideas, fear in risk-taking, lack of tolerance, lack of proper

research about what business to start and run according to the customers' needs, poor commitment, lack of business experience, lack of financial capital, and bureaucratic issues. Indeed, these are common challenges reported by various studies such as (Mangasini, 2015). However, the scope of those challenges might differ from one country to another depending on the kind of entrepreneurial investment that a particular country has done to promote entrepreneurship. In the USA, for instance, Zhou & Xu, (2012) argue that there is a serious research investment for the development of entrepreneurship in USA which helps in tackling several challenges of entrepreneurs. Therefore, it is high time for various governments including Tanzania to have a serious investment in EE specifically for students studying in HLE.

Conclusion and recommendations of the study

The study concludes that most of the higher learning institutions in Tanzania still apply traditional approaches of teaching EE. The use of the lecture method and paper and pencil form of assessment are commonly preferred by instructors while preparing students to become self-employed graduates. In due regards, the teaching of EE is still theoretical in most of higher learning institutions in Tanzania because students have either no or little chance to practice entrepreneurship while they still at colleges or universities.

Besides those challenges associated to inadequate teaching methods of EE, graduates in Tanzania are encountered by other challenges while planning to start new businesses. Some of the notable identified challenges are those related to individual or personal, legal compliance and lack of financial capital.

Based on the findings, the study has the following recommendations; firstly, students should effectively be engaged in practical activities related to entrepreneurship while they are still at the college and university. Secondly, instructors teaching EE, should be equipped with sufficient knowledge through in-service training in order to update them with relevant skills needed in the markets. Thirdly, instructors should create a balance between theoretical and practical learning while teaching EE, and fourthly, for the research purpose, colleges and universities should have their own data base concerning graduates who have succeeded to employ themselves after graduation.

REFERENCES

- Arasti, Z., Kiani, M. F., & Imanipour, N. (2013). A Study of Teaching Methods in Entrepreneurship Education for Graduate Students. *Higher Education Studies*, Volume 2 (1), 1-10.
- Bandura, A. (1994). *Self-efficacy*. In V. S. Ramachaudran (Ed.), *Encyclopedia of human behavior*, PP 71-81. New York: Academic Pres.
- Bawuah, K., Buame, S., & Hinson, R. (2006). Reflections on Entrepreneurship Education in African Tertiary Institutions. *Reflections on Entrepreneurship Education in African Tertiary Institutions*. Users/User/Downloads/78-156-1-SM.pdf.
- Byrne, J., & Toutain, O. (2012). Learning Theories in Entrepreneurship: New Perspectives. *Academy of Management Conference* (pp. 1-35). Retrived from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/265087921_Learning_theories_in_entrepreneurship_new_perspectives.
- Denscombe, M. (2010). *The good research Guide: For small scalesocia researc projects*. McMraw-Hill Education: Uk.
- Fatoki, O. (2014). An Examination of the Teaching Methods for Entrepreneurship at a South African University. *Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences*, Volume 5 (23), 518-512.
- Fayomi, E. J., Fields, Z., Arogundade, K., Hammed, O. O., Ogundipe, F., & Ganiyu, I. O. (2019). Complementary Approach to Teaching and Learning Entrepreneurship in Nigerian Universities: A Conceptual Frame. *Universal Journal of Management*, Volume 7(2), 57-77.
- Forum, W. E. (2017, November 11th 2017 – November 13th 2019). *Manama, Kingdom Of Bahrain*. Retrieved from WIEF.
- Fulgence, K. (2015). Assessing the Status of Entrepreneurship Education Courses in Higher Institutions . *Education Training*, Volume 57 (2), 239 - 258.
- Gall, J., Gall, M. D., & Borg, W. (2005). *Applying Educational Research: A practical Guide (5th edition)*. Boston: Pearson.
- Ghisina, A. (2014). Effectiveness of Entrepreneurship Education in Higher Education Institutions. *Procedia Social behavioral Sciences*, Volume 115 (1), 332-345.
- Gyamfi, G. D. (2014). Evaluating Entrepreneurship Education as a Tool for Economic Growth: The Ghanaian Experience. *British journal of education society and behavior science*, Volume 4 (3), 318-335.

- Haji, M. (2015). *Youth employment in Tanzania: Taking Stock of The Evidence and Knowledge Gaps*. Canada. Retrieved from https://www.idrc.ca/sites/default/files/sp/Documents%20EN/Youth_Employment_TANZANIA_REPORT_web-FINAL.pdf: International Research Centre.
- Hebberman, A., & Miles, M. (1994). *Qualitative Data Analysis. Expanded Source Book*. Newbury Park, CA: Sage Publication.
- Kakeng, V. V. (2019). *Does Obtaining a lot of Schooling Guarantee a Quick Transition to Employment? Evidence from TVET graduates in Tanzania*. Dar es Salaam: REPOA. Retrieved from <http://www.repoa.or.tz/repoaTz/wp-content/uploads/2019/08/Evidence-from-TVET-graduates-in-Tanzania.pdf>.
- Kalimasi, P. (2014). *The Role of Higher Education in Promoting Entrepreneurship Education : The Case of Public Universities in Tanzania. PhD Thesis*. Pretoria, South Africa. Retrieved from <http://hdl.handle.net/2263/40229>: South Africa University of Pretoria.
- Kalimasi, P. J., & Herman, C. (2016). *Integrating entrepreneurship education across university-wide curricula: The case of two public universities in Tanzania*. Retrieved from SAGE Research .
- Lekeko, M., Peter, R., & Rankhumise, E. (2012). The effectiveness of entrepreneurship education: What matters most? . *African Journal of Business Management* , Volume 6(51),12023-12032.
- Lonappan, J., & Devaraj, K. (2011). Pedagogical Innovations in Teaching Entrepreneurship. *International Conference on Management*, (pp. 513-518).
- Mangasini, A. (2015, 02 18). *Entrepreneurship Education and Business Start-Up: Assessing Entrepreneurial Tendencies Among University Graduates in Tanzania. Sokoine University of Agriculture*. Retrieved from SUA: <http://www.suaire.suanet.ac.tz:8080/xmlui/handle/123456789/799>
- Marquardt, M., & Waddill, D. (2004). The Power of Learning in aAction Learning: A Conceptual Analysis of how the Five Schools of Adult Learning Theories are Incorporated within the Practice of Action Learning. *Action Learning: Research and Practice*, Volume 1 (2), 185-202.
- Mohammed, A. A. (2018, 01 30). *Entrepreneurship Lecture Note*. Retrieved from Researchgap: Retrieved from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/326190494_Entrepreneurship_lecture_note
- Muñoz, R. M., Salinero, Y., Peña, I., & Sanchez de Pablo, J. D. (2019). Entrepreneurship Education and Disability: An Experience at a Spanish University. *Journal of Administration Sciences*, Volume 9 (34), 2-11.
- Olomi, D., & Sabokwigina, D. (2010). Entrepreneurship Education In Tanzanian Business Schools: A Nationwide Survey. *12th International Conference on African Entrepreneurship and Small Business Development* (p. 2). Dar es Salaam: The University Of Dar Es Salaam.
- Plecher, H. (2020, February 19). *Tanzania: Unemployment rate from 1999 to 2019* . Retrieved from Statista: <https://www.statista.com/statistics/809026/unemployment-rate-in-tanzania/>
- Pradhan, P., & Sahoo, S. K. (2013). Entrepreneurship Education challenges and Efforts in India. *International Journal of Research and Development*, Volume 2 (1) 1-12.
- Qian, M., & Lai, C. (2012). Entrepreneurship Education: A Chinese University Case Study. *International Journal of Business Strategy*, Volume 12, (74-82).
- Radipere, S. (2012). South African university entrepreneurship education. *Academic Journals*, Volume 6 (44) 11015-11022.
- Stufflebeam, D. L. (2003). *The CIPP model for evaluation*. In D. L. Stufflebeam & T. Kellaghan (Eds.), *The international handbook of educational evaluation (Chapter 2)*. Boston, MA: Kluwer Academic Publishers.
- Teegavarapu, S., & Summers, J. D. (2008). Case Study Method for Design Research. A Justification. . *ASME 2008 International Design Engineering Technical Conferences & Computers and Information in Engineering Conference* August 3-6, 2008. New York cit.
- Tomozyk, T., Cechrova, L., Vacek, J., Kozakova, J., & Marosna, Z. (2016). *Entrepreneurship Education theoretical framework* . https://www.researchgate.net/publication/308967438_Entrepreneurship_education_-_theoretical_framework/citation/download.
- URT. (1999). Ministry of Science, Technology and Higher Education. National Higher Education Policy. Dar es Salaam: The United Republic of Tanzania.
- URT. (2003). *SME Development Policy 2003*. United Republic of Tanzania, Ministry of Industry and Trade .
- Volkman, C., Wilson, K., Mariotti, S., Rabuzzi, D., & Vyakarnam S., S. A. (2009). *Educating the Next Wave of Entrepreneurs*, *World Economic Forum*. Available at: http://ncee.org.uk/wpcontent/uploads/2014/06/educating_the_next_wave_of_entrepreneurs.1.P
- WIEF. (2019, November 13TH). *World Entrepreneurship Investment Forum (WIEF) (NOVEMBER 11th – NOVEMBER 13th 2019)*. Retrieved from WIEF: <https://www.thewief.com/>

Zhou, M., & Xu, H. (2012). A Review of Entrepreneurship Education for College Students in China. *Journal of Administrative Science*, Volume 2, (1)83-93.