SITUATIONAL ANALYSIS OF HUMAN CAPITAL DEVELOPMENT PLANS AND THEIR IMPLEMENTATION IN PUBLIC INSTITUTIONS IN ILALA MUNICIPALITY, DAR ES SALAAM, TANZANIA

Wiboga Maige, Department of Business Administration, College of Business Education, Tanzania, P.O.BOX 1968, Dar es Salaam; E-mail:bwanamaige@yahoo.co.uk

ABSTRACT

Human capital development is among the core functions of human resource management discipline. It is also an important aspect in business organisations as it enables them to improve their productivity, competitiveness, long term survival and sustainability. This paper explores the state of human capital development in public institutions in Dar es Salaam, Tanzania. Specifically, the paper examines the existence of employees development plans in public institutions and their implementation. The study was carried out in four public institutions using a sample of 95 respondents of which 90 were non-administrative employees and 5 were administrative officials. Data from non-administrative employees were collected through structured questionnaires and focus group discussion. For administrative officials, interviews were held. Data from interviews and focus group discussion were analysed qualitatively through content analysis while the data from questionnaires were descriptively analysed whereby frequencies and percentages were computed. The study revealed that only 38% of employees agreed that the nature of staff development plans in their institutions helped them to advance their education and that only 27% of staff agreed that staff development plans in their institutions are being well implemented. In conclusion findings of the study indicate that human capital development plans are not well implemented in many public institutions due to different factors such as financial constraints. Therefore public institutions are expected to improve their human capital development plans so as to have competent employees who can increase productivity, competitiveness and sustainability of institutions.

Keywords: Employer, Employee, Human Capital Development, Public Institutions

1.0 INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background

Human Capital Development is explained as the process that relates to training, education and professional initiatives in order to increase the levels of knowledge, skills, abilities, values and social assets of an employee which will lead to the employee’s satisfaction and performance (Schultz, 1993). It is also an important input for organizations and employees’ continuous improvement in terms of knowledge, skills and abilities (Rastogi, 2000). According to Schultz (1993), the concept of human capital development is rooted from the field of macroeconomic development theory which describe the rationale for human capital advancement in terms of skills and competences for the purpose of improving effectiveness and efficiency in organizations. Becker (1993) add that there are different kinds of human capital development tasks which have to be undertaken for increasing the efficiency in institutions such tasks includes schooling, a computer training, expenditures on medical care, punctuality as well as honesty. These capital development activities improve the health of institutions, raise earnings and add to a person’s appreciation over a lifetime. In fact expenditures on education, training on different skills and provision of good medical care to workers in institutions are good investments in human capital development in which their valuable returns can be calculated.

Grossman (2000), and Lumpkin and Dess (2005) emphasize that human capital development is the most important and vital factor for economic development in any institution and that the better the education, improved skills and experience, the greater the impact on the economic development of any institution and the society in general. Hence, developing workers’ skills can give the institution an opportunity to grow and increase work effectiveness and productivity. However, literature (e.g., Lutz & Goujon, 2002) shows that human capital development and management relate widely across the world whereby countries that invest heavily in human capital do better on a wide range of social, economic and political development indicators. Studies by Becker (2010) also indicate that human capital development is very much important for any institution to increase effectiveness, efficient and productivity. In line to that different studies (e.g., Akinyemi, 2004) emphasizes that human capital development cannot be neglected by any institution if it intends to improve and succeed in terms of efficiency, competitiveness and productivity.

According to UNDP (1999) global human capital development report, Tanzania is ranked 156 out of 174 countries in the level of human capital development investment. In East Africa, Tanzania is behind Kenya and close to Uganda. The status
of human capital development described by this report indicate a challenge to human capital development initiatives in Tanzania. It is also contrary to what is being emphasized by the National employment policy which indicate intentions by the government in supporting human capital development among Tanzanian workers in public institutions (URT, 2008).

Moreover, the current state of human capital development in Tanzania does not reflect the government commitments which are indicated in the country's development vision 2025. The vision insists on the need to improve human personnel development through investment in skills development and making use of the training opportunities available in and outside the country. The vision comments on the need to transform the education system so as to improve the human capital in tandem with the socio-economic changes envisaged in the Vision 2025 (URT, 2005). This was thought to be possible through strengthening human capital development plans and policies in different sectors in the country. Such improvements would provide opportunities for different employees in different institutions to upgrade their skills.

Referring to the commitment indicated by the government of Tanzania to public employees in its human capital development policy and vision 2025, the need for rewarding public employees with good contracts which promote education advancement and skill improvements were emphasized (URT, 2005; 2010). Plans to implement this policy and vision are not clearly known in different institutions in the country. That is the reason this study seeks to explore the state of human capital development plans in public institutions and their implementations in Ilala Municipality in Dar es Salaam.

To effectively address this gap, this paper focused on different objectives; Firstly, the existence of staff development plans in public institutions was examined, secondly the implementation of staff development plans in public institutions was assessed and thirdly the administrators' perception on the state of staff developments in public institutions was explored.

Findings from this study are expected to generate knowledge to human resources practitioners on the state of human capital development in public institutions in the perspectives of developing nation particularly Tanzania. This will help to enlighten challenges and way forward regard to Human Capital development programmes. Moreover, findings from the field will be useful to assess the implementation of government policies in day to day operations and plans of public institutions. The study might give an insight also in the process of developing new policies relevant to public institutions in Tanzanian working environment.

2.0 REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE

According to the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD, 2001) human capital development is regarded as accumulation of knowledge, skills, competencies and attributes embodied in individuals that facilitate the creation of personal, social and economic well-being. This means that to develop a competitive advantage, any institution is required to truly emphasize and invest in human capital development so as to improve the workforce which can then play as a competitive weapon.

On top of that Maimunah & Lawrence (2008) argue that improving workforce productivity through comprehensive human capital development programmes is the most important task for a long term survival and sustainability of an institution. This is because the constantly changing business environment requires institutions to strive for superior competitive advantages via dynamic business plans which incorporate creativity and innovativeness. Such elements are essentially important long term sustainability of institutions (Barney, 1995). Moreover, Agarwala (2003) insists that human capital development plays a significant role in enhancing institutions’ competitiveness and performance. Therefore, to accomplish this undertaking, the institutions are needed to invest resources in order to ensure that employees have the knowledge and skills needed for effectively increasing work productivity.

Findings from different literatures (e.g., Grossman, 2000; Lumpkin & Dess, 2005) indicates that there is a significant relationship between innovativeness which is the product of human capital development and institutions performance. In some cases, financial performance measures such as percentage of sales resulting from new products, profitability, capital employed and return on assets are indicators of institutional performance which are pre-determined by the nature of human capital development plans and policies (Selvarajan et al., 2007). Emphasizing the social and economic importance of human capital development, Becker and Barry (1996) claim that, the most valuable of all capital types is investment in human being. Regardless of the application, these scholars consider education and training to be the most important investment in human capital which can help to fast drive development in a firm through improved effectiveness and efficiency.

According to Bontis and Fitzenz (2002), human capital development is a combination of factors such as education, training, experience, intelligence, energy, work habits, trustworthiness, initiatives and others that affect the value of the worker’s marginal product. In this sense education either formal or informal plays a crucial role in developing and securing human...
capital and it is directly linked to the developments of institutions and firms. In line to that, Dooley (2000) adds that, human beings are the active agents who accumulate capital, exploit natural resources, build social, economic and political organizations, and carry forward national development. Hence it is important to emphasize on the need for developing human personnel for advancement of any organization.

A decision to invest in human capital, like a decision to invest in other assets, is very much important though it requires comparing costs to use with benefits to be received in the future. Human beings are optimizers as they strive to acquire the skills and experiences that sell them in the labour market (Drucker, 1999). Furthermore, different scholars such as Garavan, Morley, Gunnigle and Collins (2001) also argue that, the principal cost to the individual is the time required to produce an additional value of each of the skills and experience required by the labour market. This is because the marginal products will be the primary determinants of individual’s compensation and they are directly related to skills levels possessed before and after training. Therefore, it is the matter of fact that for any institution or organisation to succeed, it should make sure that human capital development is enhanced.

3.0 METHODOLOGY
The study employed both quantitative and qualitative research approaches. The two approaches were used concurrently. Moreover the cross-sectional survey research design was considered to suffice collection of information in relatively short period of time which are useful in making predictions.

The study was carried out in Ilala Municipality, Dar es Salaam region which is located in the eastern part of Tanzania. Majority of the people in this region are engaged in office works in government and private owned institutions and organizations as well as international organizations and companies. This area was considered to be ideal for this study due to presence of many government schools, hospitals and social welfare departments. The target population in this study were teachers, accountants, community development officers, administrative officers and doctors from public sector. Public servants working in these institutions were estimated to be over 1000. The intended respondents were sampled purposively by considering their roles in their respective institutions.

A structured questionnaire with both closed and open-ended items were used in collecting data from non-administrative employees. Focus group discussions were conducted to some employees so as to obtain their opinions and feelings in addition to the information obtained through in the questionnaire. On the other hand, employers and administrative officers were interviewed using semi-structured interview guide questions. The estimated time for the interview was between 15 to 20 minutes for each respondent and focus group discussion was between between 40 to 45 minutes. On top of that questionnaire completion with employees took about 10 to 15 minutes. Data from interviews and focus group discussion were analysed qualitatively through content analysis while the data from questionnaires were analysed by the Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS) version 15.0 (Pallant, 2005), then quantitatively computed to produce frequencies and percentages. Data were summarized and presented for interpretation and discussion.

4.0 RESULTS AND DISCUSSION
The findings from this study are presented in respect of objectives intended to be accomplished. Depending on the requirements raised by the objectives and the nature of instruments used the results obtained are presented in the sections below.

Socio-demographic characteristic of the respondents
Table.1: Demographic and Descriptive Characteristics of Respondents (n = 95)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Socio-demographic variable</th>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Number of respondents (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Age in (years)</td>
<td>Less than 30</td>
<td>18 (18.9)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>30-39</td>
<td>55 (57.9)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>40-49</td>
<td>12 (12.6)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>50 and above</td>
<td>5 (5.3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sex</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>45 (47.4)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>50 (52.6)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institution</td>
<td>Benjamin W. Sec.School</td>
<td>41 (43.2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Jangwani Sec. School</td>
<td>19 (20)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ministry of Education and Vocational Training</td>
<td>22 (23.2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ilala Municipal Council</td>
<td>13 (13.7)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### 4.1 Existence of Staff Development Plans in Public Institutions

To address this objective, respondents were required to indicate the existence of employees’ development plans in their institutions and the impacts of these plans in their professional development. To accomplish this task, respondents provided their responses by completing questionnaire and the results are summarized in Table 2.

**Table 2: Existence of Staff Development Plans in Public Institutions**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables tested</th>
<th>Level of agreement from different professionals</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Teachers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My institution has good staff development plan</td>
<td>F (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My institution staff development plan do not favour staff development</td>
<td>13(19)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>According to my institution staff development plan, it is difficult to acquire financial support for further studies</td>
<td>51(77)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My institution support staff development as stipulated in the development plan</td>
<td>22(33)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My institution staff development plan is realistic</td>
<td>36(55)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The response of my institution to staff development plan is fair</td>
<td>35(53)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: F = Frequency, % = Percentage

The responses in Table 2 indicated that 19% teachers, 90% accountants, 0% community development officers and 80% others agreed that there were good staff development plans in their institution. However, 80% teachers, 10% accountants and 60% of other professionals stressed that staff development plans available do not favour staff development. In line to that, 51 (80%) teachers, one accountants (10%), six (100%) community development officers and six (60%) others acknowledged that it is difficult to acquire financial support from employers.

On top of that, employees made a comment that their institutions provided support to staff development as stipulated in development plan by 22 (33%) teachers, eight (80%) accountants, none (0%) community development officers and three (20%) other officers.

Employers’ plans to develop staff were said to be realistic by 36 (55%) teachers, eight (80%) accountants, none (0%) community development officers and 10 (80%) other officers.

Furthermore, the responses of institutions to provide human capital development was said to be fair by 35 (53%) teachers, 7 (70%) accountants, 2 (40%) community development officers and others 8 (62%). The variation in responses from the respondents indicated that, although public servants were employed by the same employer, some employees were better academically developed than others. For instance, the data from the field indicated that accountants were more developed in terms of skills followed by others (human resource managers, doctors, programme managers and teachers), while community development officers were poorly advanced academically as indicated in Table 2.

In general, the findings indicate low level of commitment in public institutions in supporting staff towards skill developments and advancements the fact which can affect work performance among employees. Such findings provide a contrasting situation in regard to what was emphasized by Becker (1996) who explained the importance of human capital development for institutions to strive and increase productivity. Moreover, the current trend of giving less consideration to...
human capital development plans implementations can also lead to less efficiency among employees in their daily duties (Lutz & Goujon, 2001). The findings from this study emphasize that human capital development plans are to some degree found in some public institutions though at low level. Moreover, the absence of effective and working human capital development plans in public institutions can results into some workers being discouraged the fact which can also lower their efficiency in their institutions. Therefore, it is important to make sure that human capital development plans are effectively working and known to employees in institutions. This can help to give workers opportunity to advance their knowledge and skills for the benefit of institutions.

4.2 State of Implementing Human capital Development Plans in Public Institutions
To address this objective, respondents were required to indicate the state of implementing human capital development plans in public institutions in Dar es salaam, Tanzania. To accomplish this task, respondents were required to state their degree of agreement with different constructs which were intended to measure the level of implementing staff development plans at institutional level as emphasized by the country policy. The responses to this objective were as indicated in Table 3.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables tested</th>
<th>Yes F (%)</th>
<th>No F (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>There is staff development plans in my institution which is well implemented</td>
<td>24(26.7)</td>
<td>71(73.3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The nature of staff development plans in my institution caused me to remain in the same level of education as from my time of employment</td>
<td>52(57.8)</td>
<td>43(42.2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The nature of staff development plans in my institution helped me to advance the level of education as compared to the time of first employment</td>
<td>34(37.8)</td>
<td>61(62.2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The academic development I acquired since my employment was not supported by the employer</td>
<td>59(65.6)</td>
<td>36(34.4)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The academic development I attained since my employment is the result of my personal efforts</td>
<td>84(93.3)</td>
<td>11(6.7)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The academic development I attained since my employment is the result of funding from other institutions or organisations</td>
<td>34(37.8)</td>
<td>61(62.2)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: F = Frequency, % = Percentage

With regard to the responses in table 3, very few respondents 24 (26.7%) agreed that the human capital development plans were well implemented at institution level. In line to that 52(57.8%) of all workers included in this study agreed to the fact that the nature of staff development plans in their institution was a reason for them to remain at the same level of education from their time of employment.

Surprisingly, 59 (65.6%) of respondents indicated that the academic advancement they had at the time of this data collection was not supported in any way by their current employers and that 84 (93.3%) of the employees reported to use their own means to obtain the academic development they added since then.

These findings indicate that majority of employees are not getting much support from their institutions. This fact might signal that human capital development plans in Tanzania are not effectively implemented as it was promised by the government in different policy documents and development plans such as Vision 2025 (URT, 2005; URT, 2010). The indicated state of workers report in relation to their observation regarding the role of their institutions in knowledge and skills development might contribute to their low level of work motivation and probably might affect their attachment to institutions. On top of that, failures of institutions to provide support for academic development among employees might results into a possibility of workers having low level of creativity and innovativeness due to changes in terms of science and technology which might leave them less updated as indicated in different literatures (e.g., Grossman, 2000; Lumpkin & Hess, 2005).

Moreover, after completing the questionnaire, some employees were involved in a short focus group discussions so as to get the detailed feeling in relation to realities on the state of human capital development at their institutions. During the discussions their responses were as indicated below:-

“Our employer does not support us financially in order to advance our career. Even if one acquires admission to an institution for higher learning nobody bothers to assist him/her. I remember last year, when three teachers (diploma holders) got admission to the University of Dar es Salaam to pursue their studies in the same career; they were removed from the payroll on the allegation that they were absent from duties without permission. And worse is when one wants to pursue masters degree studies; they say that, that level is not necessary for a secondary school teacher.”
Contributing on the same aspect during focus group discussion, another teacher insisted that:-

“In general, the majority of us have failed to advance our career due to poor cooperation we get from our employer. Some employees who are working at the Ministry of Education, when they acquire admission for furthering their career are supported by the employer, but we, other teachers, who are curriculum implementers are treated differently. I wonder? Syllabi are changing now and then, but we implementers of whatever changes of the curriculum, are left behind. For sure, I don’t know where this country is heading to.

The findings under this objective indicate challenges in relation to implementation of human capital development policy and plans at the level of institutions in Dar es Salaam. This is a fact because many workers indicate that there is less support from their institutions and even the advancement attained by many employees is not a result of efforts from the employees’ institutions. Hence, the revealed situation indicates a challenge in supporting employees in their professional development, the reason which can result into less commitment to work and less productivity in public institutions.

In fact, the findings in this study give a contrasting picture in regard to what is emphasized in different studies (e.g., Akinyemi, 2004) whereby it is emphasized that for employees to effectively help the institutions in raising production and remaining competitive, employees need to have the knowledge, skills, and competencies so that they can work effectively in a rapidly changing and complex working environment. Furthermore, research findings from different scholars (e.g., Agarwala, 2003) emphasize that human capital enhancement in institutions if managed and made effective can result into greater performance among employees and might support institutions’ growth.

4.3 Administrator’s Perception on the State of Human Capital Development in Public Institutions

To address this objective, administrators were required to indicate the existence of employees’ development plans in public institutions in Dar es Salaam, Tanzania. The researcher interviewed the employers to give their views on whether they had human capital development plans in their institutions. The responses from these heads of institutions who mostly stand on behalf of employers indicated that there were human capital development plans in their institutions. However, there were difficulties in getting support from the employer for academic and skill advancement to some employees in some professions such as teachers due to budget constraints and bureaucracy. To clarify on this, some heads of institution commented as indicated below:-

“Our Education policy allows employees (teachers) to advance their career in order to improve performance; the employer is responsible to support these employees but, due to bureaucracy and nepotism in implementing the policy, none of my teachers have received financial support from the employer. Normally, they advance their career/academic at their own cost”.

When the permanent secretary at the Ministry of Education and Vocational Training, who is the main employer for teachers was interviewed, his views about supporting employees in their professional development, the response was as follows:-

“We have the policy which stipulates the procedures to be followed by employees who want to advance their career, and we do encourage employees to advance their career in order to improve their performance. Nevertheless, our budget is too small to allow us sponsor all employees who get admission to different universities/colleges to further their career. We would like to advance our employees academically for sustainable development but, due to the budget constraints, we normally fail. Very few employees are sponsored, almost 3%.”

Some employers had mixed feelings when it came to developing employees as they thought that many employees, when supported to advance their studies, would not turn up after their studies. One human resource and administrative officer of Ilala Municipal Council said:

“I have the experience of teachers leaving their working station for further education. For instance, last year, five diploma holder teachers and two degree holders left for their studies; out of them four diploma teachers and the two degree holders were supported by our council and only one was self-sponsored, but to my surprise only two teachers went back to their former stations of work after completion of their studies.”

These responses from administrative officials (heads of schools and the permanent secretary) indicated that there were programmes for human capital development; however, the programmes were not effective. The reasons mentioned included budget constraints and fear of losing employees. This would imply that most employees advance their education at their own costs, a situation which leads to only a few employees advancing their education and leaving a good number of employees working with the same levels of education as when they were employed. Accordingly, the effectiveness and efficiency of the workers at their institutions is lowered the condition which can result into delayed development. The responses provided under this objective clearly show that most employees are not developed academically with support
from their employers the situation which is not good for the development of the employees and for organizational advancement as indicated in different studies (Rastogi, 2000; Schultz, 1993; Becker, 1993).

Therefore, more efforts are required by employers to make human capital development plans a reality in public institutions. This is possible by preparing a good training policy at institutional level which reflect the national employee development policy and plans (URT, 2008). This is necessary so as to provide equal opportunity to all employees in advancing their career for betterment of both institutions and the country at large.

5.0 CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

From the findings in this study, it is concluded that majority of employees in public institutions in, Dar es Salaam-Tanzania indicate dissatisfaction with the implementation of human capital development plans at institution level. More importantly, employees report to have largely gained academic advancement in their profession either through their own means or from other organizations outside their employers. The main reasons which hinders the effective implementation of human capital development policy and plans as stipulated in the national development plans was reported by institution administrators to be mainly financial challenges and budget constraints.

On the basis of the findings from this study, it is recommended that employers need to develop a mechanism for employee skill and academic development which can be shared to different stakeholders and seek collaborations and support in a win-win basis. In line to that, the head of institutions in collaboration with the central government, should develop a clear guideline which indicate the criteria for employee to be given support and chance to go for further studies. This might reduce the feeling from employees that some of them are not treated well in their institutions. In general the government through its organs should see it to the level that the good human capital development policies are kept to practice so as to help the public institutions to have relevant skills all the time. To develop this area of study we suggest that further research can attempt to determine the relationship between employees’ professional development and their mobility in search for new employments in different institutions.

Acknowledgement

I would like to thank our Almighty God for the blessings which made me prosper and engage in this research to the level of producing this paper. My gratitude also go to my academic advisor and reader Mr. Yona Matekere for his support and intellectual guidance. In line to that, I appreciate the contribution from my friend Nkuba Mabula for proof reading and for offering a second eye on this work. Moreover I wish to extend my sincere thanks to the heads of different institutions in Dar es Salaam who allowed me collect data in their institution and sometimes responding to some questions regarding this study. Finally is to all my respondents who reserved their precious time to respond to questions and participate in interviews and focus group discussion. Thank you all, it was great to have you in my study!

REFERENCES


